

Bioethics PHL281 H1F
 University of Toronto, St. George
 May-June 2018

Instructor: Jessica Wright jessicajulia.wright@mail.utoronto.ca

Lecture (LM158): Monday 6-8PM, Wednesday 6-9PM

Instructor Office Hours: Thursdays 3-5 (subject to change)

Teaching Assistants:

Mikaela Mackenzie mikaela.mackenzie@mail.utoronto.ca,

Eric Wilkinson eric.wilkinson@mail.utoronto.ca

Tutorials (LM123 OR ES1016M): Mondays 8-9PM, Wednesdays 5-6PM

COURSE DESCRIPTION

This course is an investigation of the moral, ethical, and legal issues arising in the practice of medicine and the use and creation of medical technologies. We will be looking at cases that give rise to bioethical questions, and trying to better understand the role that ethical theory plays in dealing with them. We will start with a focus on bioethical questions to do with the medical care of and ethical status of individuals; including questions having to do with birth (pregnancy, abortion), how doctors should treat patients (autonomy, informed consent), and the end of life (death and euthanasia). After that we will focus on bioethical questions having to do with the practice of medicine and bioethical issues arising on a social and technological level: issues having to do with how we understand concepts of disease, abnormality, and health, the rationing of limited medical goods, CRISPR gene editing, enhancement, and choosing against disability. Questions we will investigate include: Is abortion immoral, or immoral in some cases? How much information should doctors give their patients about medical procedures or diagnoses? Is death always bad? Is suicide permissible? Should we be allowed to edit our genes to get rid of genetic diseases, disability, or old age? How should we ration limited medical goods and supplies?

TEXTS

All required readings are available in PDF form online via the course website on Blackboard, or via the University of Toronto libraries website. Blackboard is the main way that I will be communicating with you in this course, and you are responsible for checking it regularly.

The following text is recommended but **not required**:

Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer (2009) *A Companion to Bioethics* (Blackwell)

→[available online for free via the University of Toronto libraries system, some chapters assigned for class readings]

COURSE REQUIREMENTS

You **must** register on ACORN for one of the tutorial slots to take this class. Attendance and participation in tutorials is mandatory. **Failure to complete any of the course requirements listed below may result in no grade being assigned for the course.** Your grade will be based on completion of the following requirements:

- 10%** Attendance and participation in tutorials (**weekly**)
- 5%** Reflection pieces (**4 through semester**)
- 20%** First essay (**Due Tuesday May 22**)
- 30%** Second essay (**Due Monday June 11**)
- 35%** Final exam (**date TBD, sometime the week of June 20-26**)

Late Papers will be penalized in proportion to their tardiness, with grades reduced by **3%** per day of lateness. Paper submission will be via upload to the course website; specific instructions will be given in class or via the course website.

TURNITIN

Normally, students will be required to submit their course essays to Turnitin.com for a review of textual similarity and detection of possible plagiarism. In doing so, students will allow their essays to be included as source documents in the Turnitin.com reference database, where they will be used solely for the purpose of detecting plagiarism. The terms that apply to the University's use of the Turnitin.com service are described on the Turnitin.com web site. Note that use of Turnitin.com is voluntary. Those who do not wish their papers to be uploaded to Turnitin.com may be asked to verbally defend and describe their paper in person with the instructor.

ACCESSIBILITY NEEDS

Students with diverse learning styles and needs are welcome in this course. The University of Toronto is committed to accessibility, as am I as a course instructor. If you require accommodations for a disability, or have any accessibility concerns about the course, the classroom, or course materials, please contact me at jessicajulia.wright@mail.utoronto.ca and/or contact Accessibility Services as soon as possible: (416) 978 8060 or disability.services@utoronto.ca or studentlife.utoronto.ca/accessibility.

EMAIL POLICY

I will do my best to respond to email within four academic days of receipt. Your TA will announce their own email policy in tutorials.

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY

Academic integrity is fundamental to learning and scholarship at the University of Toronto. Participating honestly, respectfully, responsibly, and fairly in this academic community ensures that the U of T degree that you earn will be valued as a true

indication of your individual academic achievement, and will continue to receive the respect and recognition it deserves. Students are expected to know what constitutes Academic Integrity. Familiarize yourself with the University of Toronto's Code of Behaviour on Academic Matters:

<http://www.governingcouncil.utoronto.ca/policies/behaveac.htm>.

SCHEDULE OF READINGS

Unless otherwise noted, all readings are required. Readings are subject to change. You are expected to do all readings before the date on which they are assigned.

WEEK 1: Introduction, Procreation and Abortion

Monday May 07 (6-8): Introduction, Ethical Theory and Bioethics, Saviour Siblings

Readings today are NOT required

- (1) James Rachels (1991) "When Philosophers Shoot From the Hip" *Bioethics* 5(1): 67-71.
- (2) James Rachels (2009) "Ethical Theory and Bioethics" Chapter 2 in *A Companion to Bioethics: Second Edition* Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 15-23.

Wednesday May 09 (6-9): The Ethics of Abortion

- (1) Mary Anne Warren (1973) "On the Moral and Legal Status of Abortion" *The Monist* 57(1): 43-61.
- (2) Judith Jarvis Thomson (1971) "A Defense of Abortion" *Philosophy and Public Affairs* 1(1): 47-66.

Suggested (not required):

-Michael Tooley (2009) "Personhood" in *A Companion to Bioethics: Second Edition* Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp.129-139.

WEEK 2: Doctor-Patient Relationships: Autonomy & Informed Consent

Monday May 14 (6-8): Autonomy & Informed Consent

- (1) Gerald Dworkin (1988) "Autonomy and Informed Consent" in *The Theory and Practice of Autonomy*, pp.100-120.
- (2) Rebecca Kukla (2005) "Conscientious Autonomy: Displacing Decisions in Health Care" *Hastings Center Report* 35(2): 34-44.
- (3) Onora O'Neill (2003) "Autonomy: The Emperor's New Clothes" *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society: Supplementary Volumes* 77: 1-21

Suggested (not required):

-Robert Young (2009) "Informed Consent and Patient Autonomy" Chapter 44 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 530-540.

Wednesday May 16 (6-9): Autonomy & Informed Consent: Truth-Telling and Paternalism

- (1) Gerald Dworkin (1988) "Paternalism—Some Second Thoughts" in *The Theory and Practice of Autonomy* pp.121-129.
- (2) Onora O'Neill (1984) "Paternalism and Partial Autonomy" *Journal of Medical Ethics* 10: 173-178.
- (3) Sarah Conly (2014) "Author Meets Critics Precis: Against Autonomy—Justifying Coercive Paternalism" *Journal of Medical Ethics* 40: 349.
- (4) Jennifer Jackson (1991) "Telling the Truth" *Journal of Medical Ethics* 17: 5-9.
- (5) Daniel Sokol (2007) "Can Deceiving Patients be Morally Acceptable?" *British Medical Journal* 334: 984-986.

Suggested (not required):

- Roger Higgs (2009) "Truth-Telling," Chapter 43 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 520-529.
- Carl Elliott (2009) "Patients Doubtfully Capable or Incapable of Consent" Chapter 45 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 541-550.

WEEK 3: Euthanasia

Monday May 21 (6-8): VICTORIA DAY HOLIDAY NO CLASS

Wednesday May 23 (6-9): Euthanasia

- (1) James Rachels (1975) "Active and Passive Euthanasia" *The New England Journal of Medicine* 292(2): 78-80.
- (2) Philippa Foot (2002) "The Problem of Abortion and the Doctrine of the Double Effect" in *Virtues and Vices: and Other Essays in Moral Philosophy* pp. 19-32.

Suggested (not required):

- Dan W. Brock (2009) "Medical Decisions at the End of Life" Chapter 23 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 263-273.

WEEK 4: Death, Suicide

Monday May 28 (6-8): Death

- (1) Thomas Nagel (1970) "Death" *Noûs* 4: 73-80.
- (2) Bernard Williams (2010) "The Makropulos Case: Reflections on the Tedium of Immortality" Chapter 6 in *Problems of the Self*, pp. 82-100.

Suggested (not required):

- Brian Stoffell (2009) "Voluntary Euthanasia, Suicide, and Physician-Assisted Suicide" Chapter 27 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Kuhse and Singer, pp. 312-320.

Wednesday May 30 (6-9): Suicide

- (1) Valerie Gray-Hardcastle and Rosalyn Walker-Stewart (2002) "Supporting Irrational Suicide" *Bioethics* 16(5): 425-438.

(2) Graber, G. C. (1981) "The Rationality of Suicide" in *Suicide and Euthanasia: The Rights of Personhood*, S. Wallace and A. Eser (eds.), Knoxville: U. Tennessee Press, pp. 51-65.

WEEK 5: Justice and Medical Care

Monday June 04 (6-8): NO CLASS

Wednesday June 06 (6-9): Rationing

(1) Norman Daniels (2001) "Justice, Health and Health Care" *Bioethics* 1(2): 2-16.

(2) John Harris (1995) "Could we Hold People Responsible for their own Adverse Health?" *Journal of Contemporary Health and Law Policy*

Suggested (not required):

-Scheunemann & White "The Ethics and Reality of Rationing in Medicine"

-John Harris (2009) "Deciding Between Patients" Chapter 29 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 335-350.

WEEK 6: Medicine and Emerging Technologies

Monday June 11 (6-8): Genetic Enhancement

(1) Giubilini, Alberto and Sagar Sanyal (2015) "The Ethics of Human Enhancement" *Philosophy Compass* 10(4): 233-243.

(2) Savulescu, Julian (2018) "Genetic Interventions and the Ethics of Enhancement of Human Beings" in *Oxford Handbook of Bioethics*, edited by Bonnie Steinbock, Oxford: Oxford University Press, pp. 516-535.

(3) Michael Sandel (2004) "The Case Against Perfection" *The Atlantic*

Suggested (not required):

-Radiolab CRISPR available online here: <https://www.wnycstudios.org/story/update-crispr/> [listening time: approximately 51 minutes]

- Julian Savulescu (2009) "Genetic Enhancement" Chapter 20 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer, pp. 216-234.

Wednesday June 13 (6-9): Eugenics, Selecting Against Disability

(1) Jeff McMahan (2005) "Causing People to Exist and Causing People to be Disabled"

(2) Robert Sparrow (2011) "A Not-So-New Eugenics--Harris and Savulescu on Human Enhancement." *The Hastings Center Report* 41(1): 32-42.

Suggested (not required):

-Laura Purdy (2009) "Assisted Reproduction, Prenatal Testing, and Sex Selection" Chapter 17 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Kuhse and Singer, pp. 178-192.

-Angus Clarke (2009) "Genetic Counseling, Testing and Screening" Chapter 22 in *A Companion to Bioethics* edited by Kuhse and Singer, pp. 245-259.

Monday June 18 (6-8): Conclusion, Course Review